



Staff Report

Case #358

COA23-45129

Ocala Historic Preservation Advisory Board: May 2, 2024

Petitioner: Joe & Kelli Carvalho

Property Owner: Joe & Kelli Carvalho

Project Planner: Breah Miller, Planner II

Applicant Request: To modify previously approved COA #23-45129 by selecting the JELD-WEN custom wood double hung windows with Seedy Remy glass windows, four black aluminum colonial grill doors, one solid wood door with a JELD-WEN 6203 glass panel, natural slate roofing material, off-white natural marbled limestone plaster cladding, and a six-foot wood privacy fence.

Parcel Information

Acres: ±0.11 acres

Parcel(s) #: 2820-031-006

Location: 200 block of SE 2nd Street

Future Land Use: Neighborhood

Existing Use: Vacant

Background:

The property is a vacant lot which has never been developed. The subject property is a Lot of Record pursuant to City of Ocala Code of Ordinances Section 122-249, and is located in the Ocala Historic District. The subject parcel once served as driveway access and rear yard for the adjacent property located to the west, 205 SE Sanchez Avenue. The adjacent property was sold separately while the subject lot remained in the applicant's ownership. On August 3, 2023, the applicant received approval for the New Construction of a single-family residence with the condition that the applicant returns, at later date, with specifics on the roofing, siding, windows, and doors. After the Ocala Historic Preservation Advisory Board's approval, the applicant received approval from the Board of Adjustment for a front setback reduction of twenty (20) feet to thirteen (13) feet and a rear yard setback reduction from twenty-five (25) feet to fifteen (15) feet in the R-3, Multi-Family zoning district on December 18, 2023.

Staff Analysis

Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria for Decisions (Section 94-82(g)):

The Code states that the Board may issue a certificate of appropriateness for the reconstruction, alteration, new construction, non-permanent structures, demolition, partial demolition, or removal of any building or structure within a locally designated historic district or any designated local landmark, or any other activity for which a CA is required, if such action is not deemed contrary to the purposes of historic preservation and to the special character of districts, sites and resources as designated specifically. The board's decisions will be based on the Secretary of the Interior's

Standards, the city's Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, this chapter, and the following criteria:

1. Exterior alterations shall not diminish the architectural quality or historical character of the building or the building site.

The exterior specifics for the windows, doors, siding, and roof are similar in visual character to the approved single-family residence renderings that were proposed during the August 3, 2023 meeting. The selected windows, doors, siding, and roof material does not diminish the architectural quality or historical character of the building or the building site.

2. Sandblasting of any materials except for iron is prohibited.

Not Applicable; the request does not identify sandblasting of any materials.

3. Only through very controlled conditions can most historic building material be abrasively cleaned of soil or paint without measurable damage to the surface or profile of the substrate. Decisions regarding the proper cleaning process for historic structures can be made only after careful analysis of the building fabric, and testing. Generally, wet abrasive cleaning of a historic structure should be conducted within the range of 20 to 100 psi at a range of three to 12 inches.

Not Applicable; the request does not identify any abrasive cleaning.

4. Landscaping, signs, parking and site development should be sensitive to the individual building and should be visually compatible with the buildings and environment with which they are visually related.

Not Applicable; the request does not include any alteration or additional landscaping, signs, parking and site development.

5. New construction shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment with which the new construction is visually related. When an application involves new construction, the applicant may present conceptual plans to the board for review and comment before the application for a certificate of appropriateness is submitted and before construction drawings of the project are prepared. Aspects to be considered include:

- a. The height, volume, proportion between width and height of the facades, the proportions and relationship between doors and windows, the rhythm of solids and voids created by openings in the facades, the materials used in the facades, the texture inherent in the facades, the colors, pattern and trim used in the facades, and the design of the roof.

The placement, width, height and proportions of the proposed windows, doors, and facades were approved at the August 3, 2023, Ocala Historic Preservation Advisory Board meeting for COA23-45129.

- b. The existing rhythm created by existing building masses and spaces between them should be preserved.

The rhythm created by existing building masses and spaces between buildings were approved at the August 3, 2023, Ocala Historic Preservation Advisory Board meeting for COA23-45129.

- c. Landscape plans should be visually compatible with the buildings and environment with which the landscaping is visually related.

Not Applicable; the request does not include any proposed landscaping.

- d. Proportions of existing facades which are visually related shall be maintained when neighboring buildings have a dominant horizontal or vertical expression, that expression should be carried over in the new facade.

Not Applicable; the proposed alterations will not impact the existing façade expression.

- e. Architectural details should be incorporated as necessary to relate the new with the old and to preserve and enhance the inherent architectural characteristics of the area.

The exterior specifics for the windows, doors, siding, and roof incorporate architectural details necessary to relate the new with the old and to preserve and enhance the inherent architectural characteristics of the area.

- f. Accessory structures shall be compatible with the scale, shape, roof form, materials, and detailing of the main structure to protect the historic integrity of the neighborhood. The accessory structure shall not exceed the maximum height allowed by the applicable zoning or the height of the existing primary structure.

Not Applicable; the request does not include any proposed accessory structures.

Sec. 94-86. - Fences.

- a. *Generally.* All fences located within a locally designated historic district shall follow the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings. Any newly constructed or replacement fence shall require a certificate of appropriateness.

Pursuant to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, it is not recommended to install protective fencing, bollards, and stanchions on a building site, when necessary for security, without taking into consideration their location and visibility so that they do not negatively impact the historic character of the site. There is an ongoing trend in the 200 block of SE 2nd Street for wood privacy fencing that is causing a chain effect of negative impacts to the historic character of this area. The privacy fencing is creating a divide in how the historic sites all relate to one another, and thus is causing a negative visual impact on the area.

- b. *Materials.* New fences should complement the style, design, color and material of the building(s), the building site and the surrounding neighborhood. A single lot shall contain no more than two types of fencing material. Decorative fences made of cast iron, wrought iron, simulated wrought iron, wood pickets or other historic materials are appropriate for front yards. Privacy wood fences are appropriate for rear and side yards. Fencing material shall be appropriate to the historic time period of the locally designated historic district or local landmark. Other materials may be approved on a case-by-case basis, the board may consider alternative materials. Repairing fencing is preferred over replacement. Deteriorated sections of historic fencing should be replaced with materials of matching design, texture and color whenever possible.

The proposed wood fencing does not complement the style, design, color and material of the building and/or the building site. As stated in the response for Sec. 94-86(a), there is an ongoing trend in the 200 block of SE 2nd Street for wood privacy fencing that is causing a chain effect of negative impacts to the historic character of this area. The privacy fencing is creating a divide in how the historic sites all relate to one another, and thus is causing a negative visual impact on the area.

- c. *Height.* Decorative fences along street fronts shall allow views of the yard and building. Fence height for front yards and side yards up to the front facade is no higher than four feet and for side and rear yards at six feet. On corner lots, the maximum heights are four feet for street elevations and six feet for side and rear yards. Other heights for side and rear yards may be approved on a case by case basis if consistent with the standards.

The fencing is located in the rear and side yards and does not exceed the required 6-foot height limitation.

- d. *Placement.* New fences should be compatible with the site in facade setback, size and scale to protect the historic integrity of the neighborhood. Privacy fencing for the rear and side yards should be placed behind the front facade of the historic building. Placement should be such that it does not damage or endanger any existing tree on the building site.

The new fence is placed behind the front facade of the historic building.

The Secretary of the Interior Standards; Windows (page 102)

Recommended: Identifying, retaining, and preserving windows and their functional and decorative features that are important to the overall character of the building. The window material and how the window operates (e.g., double hung, casement, awning, or hopper) are significant, as are its components (including sash, muntins, ogee lugs, glazing, pane configuration, sills, mullions, casing, or brick molds) and related features, such as shutters.

The proposed windows do demonstrate that the decorative features were identified, retained and preserved. Windows will be wood and will have muntins to provide a historically appropriate appearance.

The Secretary of the Interior Standards; Windows (page 106)

Recommended: Using low-e glass with the least visible tint in new or replacement windows.

The proposed window that was chosen is a Low-E glass window.

Recommended: Ensuring that spacer bars in between double panes of glass are the same color as the window sash.

All components of the proposed windows match in color.

Staff Recommendation: Appropriate (windows, siding, doors, and roof material)
Staff Recommendation: Not Appropriate (Fence)