



Staff Report

Case #363

COA24-45623

Ocala Historic Preservation Advisory Board: May 2, 2024

Petitioner: Phoenix Loan Resolution
Property Owner: Phoenix Loan Resolution
Agent: Ken Close
Project Planner: Breah Miller, Planner II
Applicant Request: Replace windows with one- over- one element shield vinyl windows.

Parcel Information

Acres: ±0.13 acres
Parcel(s) #: 2820-031-006
Location: 114 NE Tusawilla Avenue
Future Land Use: High Intensity/Core Central
Zoning District: FBC, Form Based Code
Existing Use: Single-Family Residence

Background:

The existing home was constructed in 1914 using a Colonial Revival building style. The home is a contributing structure to the Tusawilla Historic District. The existing home currently has mixture of two-over-two, double-hung sash, wood windows and one-over-one, single-hung with no sash windows. The applicant is requesting to replace all windows with one-over-one, single-hung Element Shield vinyl windows with no mullions.

Staff Analysis

Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria for Decisions (Section 94-82(g)):

The Code states that the Board may issue a certificate of appropriateness for the reconstruction, alteration, new construction, non-permanent structures, demolition, partial demolition, or removal of any building or structure within a locally designated historic district or any designated local landmark, or any other activity for which a CA is required, if such action is not deemed contrary to the purposes of historic preservation and to the special character of districts, sites and resources as designated specifically. The board's decisions will be based on the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, the city's Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, this chapter, and the following criteria:

1. Exterior alterations shall not diminish the architectural quality or historical character of the building or the building site.

The home historically had one window in the front of the home that was one-over-one and the remaining windows that are visible from NE Tusawilla Avenue were historically two-over-two windows. Changing all window material to vinyl and removing the existing mullion

features will drastically change the appearance of the home, diminishing the architectural quality and historic character of the home.

2. Sandblasting of any materials except for iron is prohibited.

Not Applicable; the request does not identify sandblasting of any materials.

3. Only through very controlled conditions can most historic building material be abrasively cleaned of soil or paint without measurable damage to the surface or profile of the substrate. Decisions regarding the proper cleaning process for historic structures can be made only after careful analysis of the building fabric, and testing. Generally, wet abrasive cleaning of a historic structure should be conducted within the range of 20 to 100 psi at a range of three to 12 inches.

Not Applicable; the request does not identify any abrasive cleaning.

4. Landscaping, signs, parking and site development should be sensitive to the individual building and should be visually compatible with the buildings and environment with which they are visually related.

Not Applicable; the request does not identify landscaping, signs, parking and site development.

5. New construction shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment with which the new construction is visually related. When an application involves new construction, the applicant may present conceptual plans to the board for review and comment before the application for a certificate of appropriateness is submitted and before construction drawings of the project are prepared. Aspects to be considered include:

- a. The height, volume, proportion between width and height of the facades, the proportions and relationship between doors and windows, the rhythm of solids and voids created by openings in the facades, the materials used in the facades, the texture inherent in the facades, the colors, pattern and trim used in the facades, and the design of the roof.

The existing proportions and relationship between doors and windows will not be impacted by the proposed alteration. No windows will be added or removed.

- b. The existing rhythm created by existing building masses and spaces between them should be preserved.

Not Applicable; the proposed alterations will not impact the existing neighborhood massing, and spaces between buildings will be preserved.

- c. Landscape plans should be visually compatible with the buildings and environment with which the landscaping is visually related.

Not Applicable; the request does not include any proposed landscaping.

- d. Proportions of existing facades which are visually related shall be maintained when neighboring buildings have a dominant horizontal or vertical expression, that expression should be carried over in the new facade.

Not Applicable; the proposed alterations will not impact the existing façade expression.

- e. Architectural details should be incorporated as necessary to relate the new with the old and to preserve and enhance the inherent architectural characteristics of the area.
Changing all windows that historically had two-over-two mullions on all windows with no mullions will impact the architectural details of the home and does not preserve or enhance the inherent architectural characteristics of the area.
- f. Accessory structures shall be compatible with the scale, shape, roof form, materials, and detailing of the main structure to protect the historic integrity of the neighborhood. The accessory structure shall not exceed the maximum height allowed by the applicable zoning or the height of the existing primary structure.
Not Applicable; the request does not include any proposed accessory structures.

The Secretary of the Interior Standards; Windows (page 102)

Recommended: Identifying, retaining, and preserving windows and their functional and decorative features that are important to the overall character of the building. The window material and how the window operates (e.g., double hung, casement, awning, or hopper) are significant, as are its components (including sash, muntins, ogee lugs, glazing, pane configuration, sills, mullions, casing, or brick molds) and related features, such as shutters.

The proposed windows do not demonstrate that the decorative features were identified, retained and preserved. The windows will no longer have mullions and the materials will be changed from wood to vinyl.

Not Recommended: Removing a character-defining window that is unrepairable or is not needed for the new use and blocking up the opening, or replacing it with a new window that does not match.

With the proposed replacements, the current character-defining windows will no longer exist. An exact match of existing material may not be feasible, but utilization of a window with the same pane pattern and dimension would be a less impactful and a preferred alternative.

The Secretary of the Interior Standards; Windows (page 105)

Recommended: Replacing in kind an entire window that is too deteriorated to repair (if the overall form and detailing are still evident) using the physical evidence as a model to reproduce the feature or when the replacement can be based on historic documentation. If using the same kind of material is not feasible, then a compatible substitute material may be considered.

The proposed window do not demonstrate that the historic character of the existing windows were taken into consideration when choosing a replacement window for the home. There is no compatibility between the existing and proposed window pattern or material on all windows except the existing one-over-one.

The Secretary of the Interior Standards; Windows (page 106)

Recommended: Using low-e glass with the least visible tint in new or replacement windows.

The proposed window that was chosen is a Low-E glass window.

Recommended: Ensuring that spacer bars in between double panes of glass are the same color as the window sash.

All components of the proposed windows match in color.

Staff Recommendation: Not Appropriate