



## Staff Report

Case #172

COA24-45613

Ocala Historic Preservation Advisory Board: May 2, 2024

**Petitioner:** Jeff P. Powell

**Property Owner:** Jeff P. Powell

**Agent:** Jill Cronkrite

**Project Planner:** Breah Miller, Planner II

**Applicant Request:** After-the-fact addition of a gravel driveway to the southeastern corner of property, a gravel sidewalk, a second set of steps to the front porch, and a banister to the east elevation of porch.

### Parcel Information

**Acres:** ±0.27 acres

**Parcel(s) #:** 2820-031-006

**Location:** 715 SE 6<sup>th</sup> Street (f/k/a 717 SE 6<sup>th</sup> Street)

**Future Land Use:** Neighborhood

**Zoning District:** R-3, Multi-Family Residential District

**Existing Use:** Single-Family Residence with guest quarters

### Background:

The existing home, known as the Mathew Morgan House, was constructed in 1895 using a Frame Vernacular building style. The home is a contributing structure to the Ocala Historic District. The subject parcel houses a single-family residence and a detached apartment. The detached apartment was built along with the primary residence in 1895. The home has a set of wooden stairs leading to the main door of the primary residence which are original to the home. The applicant added a second set of wooden steps, a banister to the east elevation of the porch, a gravel sidewalk, and a stone gravel driveway to the southeastern corner of property.

The applicant came before the board on December 7, 2023, for a curb cut with a grass driveway (COA23-45441). Historically, curb cuts were alterations that went before the Ocala Historic Preservation Board in conjunction with a proposed driveway using materials such as brick, concrete, gravel, etc. Curb cuts alone do not require a Certificate of Appropriateness. However, driveway additions and new driveways in conjunction to a new curb cut do require a Certificate of Appropriateness. The applicant's curb cut request was unique due to the applicant proposing a grass driveway, as opposed to proposing a driveway using alternate materials. It received a split vote of 4-to-2 because of the Board's concerns of the impact a secondary curb cut with driveway would have on a site that has an existing gravel driveway, and the impacts of vehicles driving on the grass. During the meeting in December 2023, it was found that the applicant added the stone gravel driveway, second set of steps, gravel sidewalk, and porch banister without obtaining a Certificate of Appropriateness nor the required building permits. Therefore, the site currently has an active code enforcement case due to work being done prior to receiving a Certificate of Appropriateness.

**Staff Analysis****Existing gravel driveways within the Tusawilla and Ocala Historic district:**

*The applicant provided staff with a list of 21 addresses within or in close proximity to the historic district that have gravel driveways. Staff's findings are below.*

<b>Address</b>	<b>Findings</b>
<i>804 SE 8th Street</i>	Received Approval - COA14-0008.
<i>705 SE 4th Street</i>	Received Approval - COA19-0017.
<i>727 SE 8th Street</i>	Received Approval - COA20-0002.
<i>509 SE Sanchez Avenue</i>	Possibly Received Approval - COA05- 0057.
<i>232 NE Sanchez Avenue</i>	Possibly Received Approval - COA12-0029.
<i>1016 SE 6th Place</i>	Not within the Historic District.
<i>406 SE 8th Street</i>	Not within the Historic District.
<i>504 SE 8th Street</i>	No COA records. Gravel Driveway has existed for +/- 20 years.
<i>315 SE Sanchez Avenue</i>	No COA records. Gravel Driveway has existed for +/- 20 years.
<i>828 SE 3rd Street</i>	No COA records. Gravel Driveway has existed for +/- 20 years.
<i>114 NE Tusawilla Avenue</i>	No COA records. Gravel Driveway has existed for +/- 20 years.
<i>207 NE Sanchez Avenue</i>	No COA records. Gravel Driveway has existed for +/- 20 years.
<i>223 NE Sanchez Avenue</i>	No COA records. Gravel Driveway has existed for +/- 20 years.
<i>226 NE Sanchez Avenue</i>	No COA records. Gravel Driveway has existed for +/- 20 years.
<i>740 E Fort King Street</i>	In Violation, Driveway appeared between 2019-2021
<i>1256 E Fort King Street</i>	In Violation, Driveway appeared between 2018-2021
<i>835 SE 4th Street</i>	Possible Violation, lack of records
<i>211 NE Sanchez Avenue</i>	Possible Violation, received a COA under COA20-0029 notes say cement drive but due to documentation staff cannot tell if it was amended.
<i>716 SE 8th Street</i>	Gravel driveway is original to the home per Master Site File.
<i>502 SE Sanchez Avenue</i>	Address does not exist in our system.
<i>103 SE Tusawilla Avenue</i>	Does not have a gravel driveway.

**Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria for Decisions (Section 94-82(g)):**

The Code states that the Board may issue a certificate of appropriateness for the reconstruction, alteration, new construction, non-permanent structures, demolition, partial demolition, or removal of any building or structure within a locally designated historic district or any designated local landmark, or any other activity for which a CA is required, if such action is not deemed contrary to the purposes of historic preservation and to the special character of districts, sites and resources as designated specifically. The board's decisions will be based on the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, the city's Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, this chapter, and the following criteria:

1. Exterior alterations shall not diminish the architectural quality or historical character of the building or the building site.

*Steps: Adding steps to the existing steps does not diminish the architectural quality or the historical character of the home. The wood material is consistent with the existing materials used for the porch and first set of steps. However, the steps are not consistent with the color of the existing porch decking and steps, which does diminish the architectural quality of the home. If the applicant were to choose a compatible color or finishing coat and apply it to the steps and porch, it would assist the architectural quality remain intact by bringing consistency. However, the board and staff cannot require a specific color. A building permit may require a substantial change to the steps design, and should a substantial change occur, further review may be required.*

*Banister: The banister does diminish the architectural quality and historic character of the home. The primary residence once had a wooden banister which wrapped around the front porch. The banister was approximately 3-feet tall. Sometime between 2013 and 2022, the banister was removed. Pursuant to The Secretary of the Interior Standards, Entrances and Porches (Page 50), when replacing a missing component of entrance and porch features when the replacement can be based on documentary or physical evidence, the new work should match the old in material, design, scale, color, and finish. The new banister does not meet this standard and as a result diminishes the quality and character of the home.*

*Driveway/ Sidewalk: The gravel driveway does diminish the architectural quality but does not diminish the historic character of the home. Between the years of 2013 and 2022, the previous owner added asphalt on to the dirt driveway without appropriate approval. In 2023, the applicant placed stone gravel on to the crushed asphalt driveway.*

*Leading up to the gravel driveway is a gravel sidewalk. The sidewalk has tan stones which outline the perimeter of the walkway. The stone ends where the driveway begins, leaving the perimeter of the gravel driveway to appear unfinished. Adding additional features such as the stone outlining the driveway can assist in maintaining the architectural quality of the site.*

2. Sandblasting of any materials except for iron is prohibited.

*Not Applicable; the request does not identify sandblasting of any materials.*

3. Only through very controlled conditions can most historic building material be abrasively cleaned of soil or paint without measurable damage to the surface or profile of the substrate.

Decisions regarding the proper cleaning process for historic structures can be made only after careful analysis of the building fabric, and testing. Generally, wet abrasive cleaning of a historic structure should be conducted within the range of 20 to 100 psi at a range of three to 12 inches.

*Not Applicable; the request does not identify any abrasive cleaning.*

4. Landscaping, signs, parking and site development should be sensitive to the individual building and should be visually compatible with the buildings and environment with which they are visually related.

*Although the gravel driveway is sensitive to the individual building, it is not visually compatible with the immediate surrounding sites. 717 SE 6<sup>th</sup> Street is the only property that will have a gravel driveway along SE 6<sup>th</sup> Street, at the intersection of SE 6<sup>th</sup> Street and SE Sanchez Avenue, as well as at the intersection of SE 6<sup>th</sup> Street and SE Wenona Avenue.*

5. New construction shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment with which the new construction is visually related. When an application involves new construction, the applicant may present conceptual plans to the board for review and comment before the application for a certificate of appropriateness is submitted and before construction drawings of the project are prepared. Aspects to be considered include:

- a. The height, volume, proportion between width and height of the facades, the proportions and relationship between doors and windows, the rhythm of solids and voids created by openings in the facades, the materials used in the facades, the texture inherent in the facades, the colors, pattern and trim used in the facades, and the design of the roof.

*Not Applicable; the request does not include any alterations to the facades of the home.*

- b. The existing rhythm created by existing building masses and spaces between them should be preserved.

*Not Applicable; the proposed alterations will not impact the existing neighborhood massing, and spaces between buildings will be preserved.*

- c. Landscape plans should be visually compatible with the buildings and environment with which the landscaping is visually related.

*Driveway: The subject driveway is attached to a gravel sidewalk. The sidewalk currently has a stone buffer with will keep the gravel in place . However, the gravel driveway has no buffering to keep the gravel in place and is not visually compatible with the landscaping of the connected sidewalk.*

- d. Proportions of existing facades which are visually related shall be maintained when neighboring buildings have a dominant horizontal or vertical expression, that expression should be carried over in the new facade.

*Not Applicable; the proposed alterations will not impact the existing façade expression.*

- e. Architectural details should be incorporated as necessary to relate the new with the old and to preserve and enhance the inherent architectural characteristics of the area. *Steps: The secondary set of steps do relate to the existing steps when it pertains to the*

*wood material; although the steps do not diminish the historical character of the home, they do not enhance the inherent architectural characteristics. The applicant selecting a consistent color for the subject steps, existing steps, and porch will help satisfy this aspect.*

- f. Accessory structures shall be compatible with the scale, shape, roof form, materials, and detailing of the main structure to protect the historic integrity of the neighborhood. The accessory structure shall not exceed the maximum height allowed by the applicable zoning or the height of the existing primary structure.

*Not Applicable; the request does not include any proposed accessory structures.*

**The Secretary of the Interior Standards; Entrances and Porches (page 49):**

Recommended: Identifying, retaining, and preserving entrances and porches and their functional and decorative features that are important in defining the overall historic character of the building. The materials themselves are significant as are their features, such as door, transoms, pilasters, columns, balustrades, stairs, roofs, and projecting canopies.

**The Secretary of the Interior Standards; Entrances and Porches (page 50):**

Recommended: Protecting and maintaining the masonry, wood, and metals which comprise entrances and porches through appropriate surface treatments, such as cleaning, paint removal, and reapplication of protective coating systems.

**The Secretary of the Interior Standards; Entrances and Porches (page 110):**

Recommended: Identify, retaining, and preserving entrances and porches and their functional and decorative features that are important in defining the overall character of the building. The materials themselves (including masonry, wood, and metal) are significant, as are their features, such as doors, transoms, pilasters, columns, balustrades, stairs, roofs, and projecting canopies.

<b>Staff Recommendation: Appropriate (Porch Steps)</b>
<b>Staff Recommendation: Appropriate with Conditions (Driveway and Sidewalk)</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• <i>Continuation of stone outline on the perimeter of the driveway</i></li></ul>
<b>Staff Recommendation: Not Appropriate (Banister)</b>