



Staff Report

Case #41

COA24-45773

Ocala Historic Preservation Advisory Board: September 5, 2024

Petitioner: Juan Espinosa
Property Owner: Juan Espinosa
Project Planner: Breah Miller, Planner II
Applicant Request: To replace all windows with Simonton 5050 collection, double-hung, no grille pattern, white windows.

Parcel Information

Acres: ±0.24 acres
Parcel(s) #: 2820-000-004
Location: 709 E Fort King Street
Future Land Use: Neighborhood
Zoning District: R-3, Multi-Family Residential District
Existing Use: Single-Family Residence with guest quarters

Background:

The existing home, known as the Franny Clark House, was constructed in 1912 using a Frame Vernacular Colonial building style. The home is a contributing structure to the Ocala Historic District. The current double-hung sash wood windows are dated to the original construction of the home.

Applicant Request:

The applicant is requesting approval to replace all existing windows with Simonton 5050 Collection premium vinyl double-hung windows with no grille. The applicant cites issues with leaking and efficiency as reasons for the request.

Staff Analysis

Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria for Decisions (Section 94-82(g)):

The Code states that the Board may issue a certificate of appropriateness for the reconstruction, alteration, new construction, non-permanent structures, demolition, partial demolition, or removal of any building or structure within a locally designated historic district or any designated local landmark, or any other activity for which a CA is required, if such action is not deemed contrary to the purposes of historic preservation and to the special character of districts, sites and resources as designated specifically. The board's decisions will be based on the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, the city's Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, this chapter, and the following criteria:

1. Exterior alterations shall not diminish the architectural quality or historical character of the building or the building site.

Architecturally, the Simonton 5050 double-hung vinyl window is a durable window replacement that will operate the same as the original. The window will prevent leakage and better preserve the other architectural features of the home.

In 1912, historically, windows were wood. If the request was to be approved, vinyl will be the selected material for the replacement windows. The original windows had no grille pattern, and the replacements will be visually similar in character. Although the replacement windows will not be the same material, the proposed double-hung casement will give the same depth and appearance as the originals.

2. Sandblasting of any materials except for iron is prohibited.

Not Applicable; the request does not identify sandblasting of any materials.

3. Only through very controlled conditions can most historic building material be abrasively cleaned of soil or paint without measurable damage to the surface or profile of the substrate. Decisions regarding the proper cleaning process for historic structures can be made only after careful analysis of the building fabric, and testing. Generally, wet abrasive cleaning of a historic structure should be conducted within the range of 20 to 100 psi at a range of three to 12 inches.

Not Applicable; the request does not identify any abrasive cleaning.

4. Landscaping, signs, parking and site development should be sensitive to the individual building and should be visually compatible with the buildings and environment with which they are visually related.

Not Applicable; the request does not include any alteration or additional landscaping, signs, parking, or site development.

5. New construction shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment with which the new construction is visually related. When an application involves new construction, the applicant may present conceptual plans to the board for review and comment before the application for a certificate of appropriateness is submitted and before construction drawings of the project are prepared. Aspects to be considered include:

- a. The height, volume, proportion between width and height of the facades, the proportions and relationship between doors and windows, the rhythm of solids and voids created by openings in the facades, the materials used in the facades, the texture inherent in the facades, the colors, pattern and trim used in the facades, and the design of the roof.

Not Applicable, all alterations will be the same size as the existing.

- b. The existing rhythm created by existing building masses and spaces between them should be preserved.

Not Applicable, the proposed alterations will not affect the existing rhythm.

- c. Landscape plans should be visually compatible with the buildings and environment with which the landscaping is visually related.

Not Applicable; the request does not include any proposed landscaping.

- d. Proportions of existing facades which are visually related shall be maintained when neighboring buildings have a dominant horizontal or vertical expression, that expression should be carried over in the new facade.

Not Applicable; the proposed alterations will not impact the existing façade expression.

- e. Architectural details should be incorporated as necessary to relate the new with the old and to preserve and enhance the inherent architectural characteristics of the area.

The exterior specifics that are intended to be kept such as the trimming, grill pattern, and placement of the windows and doors incorporate architectural details necessary to relate the new with the old.

- f. Accessory structures shall be compatible with the scale, shape, roof form, materials, and detailing of the main structure to protect the historic integrity of the neighborhood. The accessory structure shall not exceed the maximum height allowed by the applicable zoning or the height of the existing primary structure.

Not Applicable; the request does not include any proposed accessory structures.

The Secretary of the Interior Standards; Windows (page 102)

Recommended: Identifying, retaining, and preserving windows and their functional and decorative features that are important to the overall character of the building. The window material and how the window operates (e.g., double hung, casement, awning, or hopper) are significant, as are its components (including sash, muntins, ogee lugs, glazing, pane configuration, sills, mullions, casing, or brick molds) and related features, such as shutters.

The way the window replacements will operate will be the same. They will remain double-hung, muntins will have at least a quarter of an inch depth, ogee profile, and trimming will stay.

The Secretary of the Interior Standards; Windows (page 106)

Recommended: Using low-e glass with the least visible tint in new or replacement windows.

Replacement glass will be low-e glass.

Recommended: Ensuring that spacer bars in between double panes of glass are the same color as the window sash.

All components of the window will be the same color.

Not Recommended: Modifying a historic single-glazed sash to accommodate insulated glass when it will jeopardize the soundness of the sash or significantly alter its appearance.

The historic single-glazed sashes will be changed to a vinyl top and bottom sash that slide up and down to provide two levels of ventilation.

Not Recommended: Using window grids rather than true divided lights on windows in low-rise buildings or on lower floors of high-rise buildings where they will be noticeable, resulting in a change to the historic character of the building.

Replacement glass will be double-strength, low-e glass.

Not Recommended: Replacing windows solely because of peeling paint, broken glass, stuck sash, or high air infiltration. These conditions, in themselves, do not indicate that windows are beyond repair.

The applicant is requesting a replacement window due to leaking and efficiency. The existing windows are not beyond repair condition currently.

Staff Recommendation: Approval