Staff Report
Case #167
COA24-0004
Ocala Historic Preservation Advisory Board: January 2, 2025

Petitioner:	Rolando Sosa
Property Owner:	Rolando Sosa
Project Planner:	Breah Miller, Planner II
Applicant Request:	To replace thirteen (13) windows with 3540 Single-Hung MI windows and remove one window from an accessory structure.

Parcel Information

Acres:	±0.30 acres
Parcel(s) #:	2820-010-006
Location:	316 SE Alvarez Avenue
Future Land Use:	Neighborhood
Zoning District:	R-3, Multi-Family Residential District
Existing Use:	Single-Family Residence

Background:

The existing home and accessory carriage home were constructed in 1923 using a Vernacular Mediterranean building style. The home is a contributing structure to the Ocala Historic District. The existing home is located at the southeastern corner of the subject property and is currently a single-family residence. The carriage home is in the northwestern corner of the subject property and has an apartment on the second floor. Both structures currently have the original windows installed. The applicant is now requesting to replace 13windows within the carriage home and remove one window located to the rear of the structure to accommodate interior renovations.

Staff Analysis

Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria for Decisions (Section 94-82(g)):

The Code states that the Board may issue a certificate of appropriateness for the reconstruction, alteration, new construction, non-permanent structures, demolition, partial demolition, or removal of any building or structure within a locally designated historic district or any designated local landmark, or any other activity for which a CA is required, if such action is not deemed contrary to the purposes of historic preservation and to the special character of districts, sites and resources as designated specifically. The board's decisions will be based on the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, the city's Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, this chapter, and the following criteria*:*

1. Exterior alterations shall not diminish the architectural quality or historical character of the building or the building site.

   The proposed exterior alteration diminishes the architectural quality or historic character of the building and building site. The 3540 Single-Hung MI window replacement will negatively

impact the building and building site; however, removal of one rear window has no impact on the historic character or architectural quality of the building or building site. The carriage home currently has the original 6-over-1 pane, wooden windows with exterior muntins and ogee profile. The proposed 3540 Single-Hung MI windows are vinyl with a 5/8" colonial grille pattern located between the glass panes. All historical characteristics of the existing windows will be lost in the proposed replacement.

2. Sandblasting of any materials except for iron is prohibited.

   Proposed alteration does not require sandblasting of any materials.

3. Only through very controlled conditions can most historic building material be abrasively cleaned of soil or paint without measurable damage to the surface or profile of the substrate. Decisions regarding the proper cleaning process for historic structures can be made only after careful analysis of the building fabric, and testing. Generally, wet abrasive cleaning of a historic structure should be conducted within the range of 20 to 100 psi at a range of three to 12 inches.

   Not applicable; the request does not identify any abrasive cleaning.

4. Landscaping, signs, parking and site development should be sensitive to the individual building and should be visually compatible with the buildings and environment with which they are visually related.

   Not applicable; the request does not include any alteration or additional landscaping, signs, parking, or site development.

5. New construction shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment with which the new construction is visually related. When an application involves new construction, the applicant may present conceptual plans to the board for review and comment before the application for a certificate of appropriateness is submitted and before construction drawings of the project are prepared. Aspects to be considered include:

   a. The height, volume, proportion between width and height of the facades, the proportions and relationship between doors and windows, the rhythm of solids and voids created by openings in the facades, the materials used in the facades, the texture inherent in the facades, the colors, pattern and trim used in the facades, and the design of the roof.

      Not applicable; the proposed alterations will not affect the existing facades of the home.

   b. The existing rhythm created by existing building masses and spaces between them should be preserved.

      Not applicable; the proposed alteration will not impact the existing neighborhood massing, and spaces between buildings will be preserved.

   c. Landscape plans should be visually compatible with the buildings and environment with which the landscaping is visually related.

      Not applicable; the request does not include any alteration or additional landscaping, signs, parking, or site development.

d. Proportions of existing facades which are visually related shall be maintained when neighboring buildings have a dominant horizontal or vertical expression, that expression should be carried over in the new facade.

Not applicable; the proposed alteration will not have any impact on the horizontal or vertical expression of the neighborhood.

e. Architectural details should be incorporated as necessary to relate the new with the old and to preserve and enhance the inherent architectural characteristics of the area.

Some of the exterior specifics that are intended to be kept, such as the trim, placement of the windows and the functionality of the window incorporate architectural details necessary to relate the new with the old. However, the proposed windows having a grille pattern between the glass panes instead of exterior muntins will remove one of the most important architectural and historical components to the building.

f. Accessory structures shall be compatible with the scale, shape, roof form, materials, and detailing of the main structure to protect the historic integrity of the neighborhood. The accessory structure shall not exceed the maximum height allowed by the applicable zoning or the height of the existing primary structure.

The proposed alteration causes a visual incompatibility between the primary single-family residences and the accessory structure. The single-family residence features wood windows with exterior muntins and ogee profile, whereas the proposed alteration would replace the windows of the accessory structure with grille patterns between the windowpanes, no exterior muntin, and vinyl material.

The Secretary of the Interior Standards; Windows (page 102)

Recommended: Identifying, retaining, and preserving windows and their functional and decorative features that are important to the overall character of the building. The window material and how the window operates (e.g., double hung, casement, awning, or hopper) are significant, as are its components (including sash, muntins, ogee lugs, glazing, pane configuration, sills, mullions, casing, or brick molds) and related features, such as shutters.

The manner in which the window replacements will operate will be similar;however, there will no longer be exterior muntins or ogee profiling.

The Secretary of the Interior Standards; Windows (page 106)

Recommended: Using low-e glass with the least visible tint in new or replacement windows.

The replacement windows will be low-e glass.

Recommended: Ensuring that spacer bars in between double panes of glass are the same color as the window sash.

All components of the window will be the same color.

Not Recommended: Modifying a historic single- glazed sash to accommodate insulated glass when it will jeopardize the soundness of the sash or significantly alter its appearance.

The historic single-glazed sashes will be changed to vinyl, welded, multi-chamber sashes. The sashes will have tilt-in bottoms for easy cleaning. The Ogee profile will be lost with this alteration.

Not Recommended: Using window grids rather than true divided lights on windows in low- rise buildings or on lower floors of high- rise buildings where they will be noticeable, resulting in a change to the historic character of the building.

The proposed grille design being placed between the glass panes will be noticeable, resulting in a change to the historic character of the building.

Not Recommended: Replacing windows solely because of peeling paint, broken glass, stuck sash, or high air infiltration. These conditions, in themselves, do not indicate that windows are beyond repair.

The applicant did imply that the window change was due to the poor condition of the existing windows, and prospective future interior renovations. There has been no further documentation as to feasibility or determination that the window conditions are beyond repair.

Staff Recommendation: Not Appropriate