



Staff Report

Case #328

COA25-0007

Ocala Historic Preservation Advisory Board: April 3, 2025

Petitioner: Richard Sherman
Property Owner: Richard Sherman & Danielle Sherman
Project Planner: Breah Miller, Planner II
Applicant Request: To replace the existing garage door with a Carriage House style garage door from the Courtyard Collection.

Parcel Information

Acres: ±0.18 acres
Parcel(s) #: 28385-004-09
Location: 1019 SE 3rd Street
Future Land Use: Neighborhood
Zoning District: R-3, Multi-Family Residential District
Existing Use: Single-Family Residence

Background:

The home was constructed in 1928 using a Brick Vernacular building style and is a contributing structure to the Ocala Historic District. The subject detached garage is not a contributing structure and was constructed in 2006 on the northwestern corner of the property. The garage was constructed using novelty wood, lap siding on the exterior with a vinyl up-and-over garage door. On February 28, 2025, the applicant received staff approval to replace the garage's siding with similar material.

Applicant Request:

The applicant is requesting to replace the existing garage door with a Carriage House style garage door from the Courtyard Collection.

Staff Analysis

Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria for Decisions (Section 94-82(g)):

The Code states that the Board may issue a certificate of appropriateness for the reconstruction, alteration, new construction, non-permanent structures, demolition, partial demolition, or removal of any building or structure within a locally designated historic district or any designated local landmark, or any other activity for which a CA is required, if such action is not deemed contrary to the purposes of historic preservation and to the special character of districts, sites and resources as designated specifically. The board's decisions will be based on the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, the city's Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, this chapter, and the following criteria:

1. Exterior alterations shall not diminish the architectural quality or historical character of the building or the building site.

The proposed exterior alteration does not diminish the architectural quality or historical character of the building nor the building site. The proposed Carriage House style garage door is more historically appropriate for a home constructed in 1928. Replacing the existing vinyl garage door will enhance the architectural quality and historic character of both the building and site.

2. Sandblasting of any materials except for iron is prohibited.

Not applicable; proposed alteration does not require sandblasting of any materials.

3. Only through very controlled conditions can most historic building material be abrasively cleaned of soil or paint without measurable damage to the surface or profile of the substrate. Decisions regarding the proper cleaning process for historic structures can be made only after careful analysis of the building fabric, and testing. Generally, wet abrasive cleaning of a historic structure should be conducted within the range of 20 to 100 psi at a range of three to 12 inches.

Not applicable; the request does not identify any abrasive cleaning.

4. Landscaping, signs, parking and site development should be sensitive to the individual building and should be visually compatible with the buildings and environment with which they are visually related.

Not applicable; the request does not include any alteration or additional landscaping, signs, parking, or site development.

5. New construction shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment with which the new construction is visually related. When an application involves new construction, the applicant may present conceptual plans to the board for review and comment before the application for a certificate of appropriateness is submitted and before construction drawings of the project are prepared. Aspects to be considered include:

- a. The height, volume, proportion between width and height of the facades, the proportions and relationship between doors and windows, the rhythm of solids and voids created by openings in the facades, the materials used in the facades, the texture inherent in the facades, the colors, pattern and trim used in the facades, and the design of the roof.

Not applicable; the proposed alteration does not include new construction and will not affect the existing facades of the home.

- b. The existing rhythm created by existing building masses and spaces between them should be preserved.

Not applicable; the proposed alteration does not include new construction and will not impact the existing neighborhood massing, and spaces between buildings will be preserved.

- c. Landscape plans should be visually compatible with the buildings and environment with which the landscaping is visually related.

Not applicable; the request does not include any alteration or additional landscaping, signs, parking, or site development.

- d. Proportions of existing facades which are visually related shall be maintained when neighboring buildings have a dominant horizontal or vertical expression, that expression should be carried over in the new facade.

Not applicable; the proposed alteration will not have any impact on the horizontal or vertical expression of the neighborhood.

- e. Architectural details should be incorporated as necessary to relate the new with the old and to preserve and enhance the inherent architectural characteristics of the area.

The proposed Carriage House style garage door is more historically appropriate for a home built in 1928. Therefore, the alteration preserves and enhances the inherent architectural characteristics of the area.

- f. Accessory structures shall be compatible with the scale, shape, roof form, materials, and detailing of the main structure to protect the historic integrity of the neighborhood. The accessory structure shall not exceed the maximum height allowed by the applicable zoning or the height of the existing primary structure.

The garage is an existing accessory structure. The proposed alteration will not impact the historic integrity of the neighborhood.

The Secretary of the Interior Standards; Entrances and Porches (page 49):

Recommended: Identifying, retaining, and preserving entrances and porches and their functional and decorative features that are important in defining the overall historic character of the building. The materials themselves (including wood, masonry, and metal) are significant, as are the features, such as doors, transoms, pilasters, columns, balustrades, stairs, roofs, and projecting canopies.

The replacement door will be made of wood material which is more historically appropriate for the site.

Staff Recommendation: Appropriate